

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Theme	No. of responses
Distress caused to relatives and residents	389
Other – not forming a theme	245
Refurbish in situ/ Agree to refurbishment	241/ 24
Negative impact on the local community	223
Concerns about the alternative options: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of suitable affordable options (44) • Quality of DCC care (23) • Suitable alternatives (16) • Financial considerations (11) • Private sector concerns (9) • Mistrust in the private sector (6) • Lack of quality alternative accommodation (10) • Questioning the definition of local (9) 	128
Questioning the rationale	128
Questioning the strategy/ Disagree with Strategy	59/ 9
Build New	38
Agree to closure	27
Pressure on other services	26
Historic maintenance	22
Questioning the Information	19
Legality of the consultation	11
Political Statement	11

Distress Caused to Residents and Families

The distress to residents and relatives caused by moving home, or by supporting their elderly relative to move home, was cited as a reason not to close any of the seven homes on a permanent basis, or according to some respondents, on a temporary basis, whilst the work is undertaken. This theme received the highest volume of responses with 389 comments in total.

Respondents raised concerns about the location of alternative homes and whether families would be able to visit new locations. Families and residents raised concerns about the impact on friendship groups that had formed and the strong relationships with staff that had developed over years.

Some residents responded that they were happy with the layout of the building in which they lived and the facilities available to them. Whilst this is important and the Council must consider its obligations to promote well-being and to ensure that a person's wishes and feelings are appropriately taken into account when planning care, it must also consider its obligations to ensure public money is used effectively through effective market shaping and commissioning. The Council must ensure its obligations to meet the eligible needs of each of the residents continue to be met. These obligations will continue to be met through assessment and planning in accordance with the Care Act 2014, explored further in Appendix 1.

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Council is mindful of the research into the impacts upon the elderly population of being required to move home and acknowledges that the potential impacts range from increased mortality through to benefits and improved outcomes. Studies show that stresses arising from friendship groups being broken up during and after any move can be mitigated via quality planning and involvement of all residents, family and staff. The Council's Major Change and Closure Guidance addresses the key factors that may cause difficulties mitigating the impact of stress caused.

The Council acknowledges that asking residents to move home, whether this is on a temporary or permanent basis, is likely to cause disruption and distress for residents and their families and this concern is evidenced by the number of responses to the consultation on this theme. The Council has experience of successfully relocating residents and through adherence to its Pledges to Residents set out at Appendix 6, it is satisfied that through careful, detailed, person centered planning, suitable alternatives can be found for current residents with as little disruption and distress as possible. Ensuring that families and friends can continue to visit will be an important part of this planning process. The Council is satisfied that for the majority of residents, the distress and any negative impact of the move can be sufficiently mitigated and will be relatively short lived.

Social workers will continue to work with current residents and their families to support them to move to suitable alternative accommodation before September 2022, whether this is for a temporary period of up to 40 weeks whilst their current home is refurbished, or on a permanent basis if a decision is made to close a home. The Council is satisfied that there are suitable local alternative options available for current residents of the seven homes as set out at Appendix 4.

Any cost implications for families will need to be carefully considered and fully appraised and the Council is committed to paying all reasonable top up fees payable as a result of moving. The Council understands how important this will be in providing residents with the support and comfort they need while they settle into their new accommodation, whether this is on a temporary or permanent basis.

Refurbish whilst the residents remain in situ/ Agree to refurbish

Some respondents expressed the view that the work required to the properties could and should be carried out whilst the residents remain in situ. The Council is satisfied that the requirement for arrangements to be made for the homes to be rewired by September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst the work to refurbish the homes is undertaken and whilst the rewiring work is outstanding.

Concerns about the negative impact on the local community

Some respondents felt any home closure could have a significant negative impact on their local community, citing examples like loss of employment opportunities with a loss of intergenerational activities taking place.

Whilst the Council appreciates and values the intergenerational activities taking place in some care homes, it is confident that the opportunity for intergenerational activity

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

exists outside the care home environment and that older people in Derbyshire are able to access this type of activity through engaging in local community groups.

The acute shortage of care workers both nationally and locally means that any loss of employment opportunity as a result of any closures would be significantly mitigated by current vacancies in the sector.

Concerns around the availability of alternative options

A number of respondents commented that being close to friends and relatives and their communities was important to residents and their loved ones. Information about the local available alternatives has been refreshed and is available at Appendix 4. This information is constantly changing and the social work teams working with residents and families affected by any of the proposals will have access to the latest vacancy data to ensure people have a clear understanding of all the available options in the local area, including the cost of those options. The information available demonstrates that there are sufficient alternative options available to offer the current residents of each of the seven homes suitable, local alternatives.

As part of the work undertaken to secure suitable, alternative accommodation, careful consideration will be given to the ability of friends and family to visit their loved ones. For example, as part of each individual assessment, consideration would be given to whether friends and relatives have access to a car, what the local transport links are like, mobility issues and any costs associated with alternative journeys.

A number of respondents raised concerns relating to the quality and cost of local private homes when compared to the Council's in-house provision. A few respondents were concerned that the Private, Voluntary and Independent sector was profit oriented and therefore felt that standard of care may sometimes be lower. Derbyshire is served by a number of excellent private providers that are subject to the same regulations and inspection requirements as the Council's inhouse services. Any cost implications, including the requirement to pay top ups, would be considered when looking at the suitable alternatives available locally for each individual.

A number of respondents felt that the proposals did not consider the future financial implications for the elderly population, nor how the costs would increase if Council run care homes were significantly reduced and that the cost of care in the private sector may be higher.

The Government's Adult Social Care Reforms aim to introduce a fair cost of care, narrowing the gap between the cost to self-funders and the cost to those supported by the Local Authority by asking local authorities to contract with providers on behalf of those who are privately paying. It is anticipated that this change will be made in October 2023 and that it will have the effect of further equalising the cost of care for self-funders and those for whom the local authority contract because there will be a shared understanding of what it costs to run quality and sustainable care provision in the local area that is reflective of local circumstances.

In addition to this reform, it is important to note that the Council is currently obliged to provide or arrange services that help keep people well and independent. This should

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

include identifying local support and resources available. In the event that a resident of a publicly funded care home is to be relocated, and the local resource available is a privately funded care home, the burden of any additional cost will be assessed on an individual basis in line with their personal budget and applicable legislation and guidance on charging for care.

Questioning the Council's rationale

Some respondents questioned the amount of work that was required to the homes and queried whether this had been exaggerated. The Council is satisfied that the advice provided by its Corporate Property Department is accurate in terms of the scope and estimated cost of the works based upon a detailed knowledge of the buildings and experience from the homes that are currently being renovated.

As part of its analysis, the Council has considered a review, completed in 2020 by a member of the public with experience in the housing sector, of the condition surveys the Council commissioned in 2018. In summary, the main focus of the report is the Spinney and the author is of the view that the fabric of the building is in good condition for a building of its age and that the proposed refurbishment work and requirement to rewire the building has been overstated. Officers note comments made in relation to The Spinney (and other homes) but the content is not considered to accurately reflect the condition of the building and scope of the work.

The council is satisfied that the maintenance, renovation and refurbishment work required at the homes is extensive and that in addition to the need to make arrangements to rewire the properties by September 2022, other significant work is required including the replacement of boilers and heating systems, the refitting of bathrooms and kitchens, work to the internal and external fabric of the buildings such as walls, windows, ceilings and floors and a full redecoration afterwards. The Council considers the cost of this work would be prohibitively expensive given that the buildings would not meet modern standards following the refurbishment and the need for this type of provision is predicted to decline in any case.

Questioning the council's strategy

Some respondents expressed their view that future proposals have been built on a flawed strategy and that the need for residential care of the kind provided at the seven establishments will be required in the future in light of the growing elderly population.

The Council is satisfied that the rationale for the proposals set out in the 18 November 2021 report is sound, including the data and information upon which the Older People's Housing, Accommodation and Support – A commissioning strategy for Derbyshire 2019 – 2035 (updated in August 2020) is based. The strategy will be referred to as Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy throughout this report. The Council is satisfied that the local analysis set out within the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy at pages 18 – 34 and the findings set out in the Interim Market Position Statement 2021-2022, demonstrate that this strategy is based upon analysis of local needs and trends, as well as data that is available regarding the national picture. The detail of this analysis is broken down by area below for each home.

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Council understands that there will always be a need for some people to receive care in a residential setting where care and support is available on a 24/7 basis. However, contrary to expectations, the 45% increase in the number of people aged 85+ since 2001 has not resulted in a corresponding increase in demand for residential care and in fact the opposite has occurred.

A study conducted by Laing-Busson in 2017 shows that there was a reduction of 4.4% in the number of people aged 85+ in residential care between 2001 and 2017 and a 10.4% reduction between 1996 and 2017. This trend reflects what the people of Derbyshire have told us. When asked directly, Derbyshire people have consistently told us that they want to remain in their own homes for as long as possible. The Council will need to utilise its resources to invest in a range of alternative models of care to ensure it can develop appropriate accommodation and support arrangements as outlined in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy in order that there are sufficient modern, purpose-built buildings to care and support people with complex needs alongside a range of options for housing with care.

Build New

Some respondents felt that new residential care homes should be built to replace the existing structures. The modelling nationally and locally described in this report and the report dated 18 November 2021 indicates that the long term need for standard residential care provided at the seven homes will decline over the coming years and the Council is required to respond accordingly. The Council does not consider it would be appropriate to replace the buildings with standard residential care homes and that the priority must be to ensure that work is undertaken with partners to deliver to the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy to ensure that there is sufficient nursing care placements and options for people to be cared for in the community by expanding the homecare market and increasing options like extra care.

Agree to closure

Some respondents agreed with the proposal to close the homes citing that the homes would not meet the standards required in the future even if they are refurbished. Respondents considered the corridors to be too narrow and the bedrooms to be too small. Some respondents considered that refurbishment would be expensive and disruptive and not the best use of public money and that that the money would be better invested to support other homes.

Pressure on other services

Some respondents expressed the view that the homes subject to consultation were in fact needed to support discharges from local hospitals. The Council operates a number of beds across its homes to support hospital discharges which are agreed with relevant stakeholders following a detailed needs analysis. It is accurate to say that the pandemic has created unique pressures that have impacted upon flow through local hospitals. As a result of these pressures, it has been necessary to access additional beds to support hospital discharges. As the pressures created by the pandemic ease, the need for additional beds to support flow through hospitals will

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ease. To invest in and continue to operate these homes on the basis that they are best placed to support hospital discharges, rather than to look beyond the immediate pressures, would be a flawed strategy.

Historic Maintenance

Some respondents expressed a view that the homes had been allowed to fall into a state of disrepair by the Council.

Essential and planned maintenance has been undertaken on these homes over the course of their lifetime but due to the age of the buildings, they now need significant refurbishment and rewiring work and as a result of the age of the properties, the specification to which they were built does not meet modern standards.

Questioning the information

Some respondents expressed a general mistrust of the information being relied upon when making proposals.

The demand figures are based upon modeling completed before the pandemic as is set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy and the Interim Market Position Statement. The Council rejects any assertion that the figures have been manipulated. The Laing-Busson study in 2017 shows that there was a reduction of 4.4% in the number of people aged 85+ in residential care between 2001 and 2017 and a 10.4% reduction between 1996 and 2017. This trend reflects what the people of Derbyshire told us. When asked directly, the people in Derbyshire told us they wanted to remain in their own home for as long as possible and for any care required to be delivered within the home where possible.

Adult Care has sought advice from its property department about the scope of the work required and is satisfied with that advice and that the estimated costs are based upon a detailed understanding of this refurbishment and rewiring work.

Petition

A petition signed by 2001 people called for future options based on Derbyshire County Council as a provider of Direct Care Homes for Older People was launched on 23rd November 2021 and closed on 23 March 2022.

Signatories to the petition requested:

We, the undersigned, note the decision of The Cabinet of 18th November 2021, reject the option of closure on the 7 care homes identified in the Cabinet report and we call on Derbyshire County Council to step-back from the implied threat to the other 16 care homes which are owned and run by the Council. We urge you to end closure speculations as this undermines confidence of staff teams that each Care Home has built up. We call for future options based on Derbyshire County Council as a provider of Direct Care Homes for Older People.

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Council does not accept there is any implied threat to other homes run by the council arising from the possible options, consultation and any decision that may be made to close any of the seven homes referred to in the report. Officers have explained why recommendations have been made specifically in relation to the future of each of the seven homes and there should be no inference made about any other establishments owned and run by the Council.

Holmlea, Tibshelf

Before making a decision about the future of Holmlea, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about Holmlea at Appendix 2.

Overall, 31 comments were captured from 10 respondents who chose to comment via email, letter, virtual meetings or telephone. There were a further 104 respondents who selected Tibshelf as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

Of the 31 comments captured the following were the top three themes:

- Distress caused to residents and relatives
- Questioning the Council's Strategy
- Other comments related to concerns around a lack of suitable alternative accommodation and praise for the quality of care provided at Holmlea.

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy, the need for residential care beds in the Bolsover area is predicted to decline by approximately 54 beds from 2018 – 2035 with a slight increase of 7 beds predicted by 2025. We can see from the vacancy data at appendix 3 that there is currently a significant number of vacancies in the Bolsover area. The need for additional nursing home beds in this area is predicted to increase by around 139 beds over the next 15 years. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a cost of £4,258,450, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will choose and need in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that Holmlea is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.

The Spinney, Brimmington

Before making a decision about the future of The Spinney, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about The Spinney at Appendix 2.

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Overall, 54 comments were captured from 18 respondents who chose to comment via email, letter, virtual meetings or telephone. There were a further 105 respondents who selected the Spinney as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

Of the 54 comments captured the following were the top three themes:

- Distress caused to residents and relatives
- Concerns raised about the legality of the consultation
- Questioning the rationale

The Council is satisfied the consultation allowed for meaningful engagement with all stakeholders as required by law. By using Microsoft Teams to discuss proposals with residents, families and other stakeholders, people involved were able to clearly express their views and provide feedback after hearing the proposals and rationale.

The Council received a review, completed in 2020 by a member of the public with experience in the housing sector, of the condition surveys the Council commissioned in 2018. The main focus of the report is the Spinney and the author is of the view that the fabric of the building is in good condition for a building of its age and that the proposed refurbishment work and requirement to rewire the building has been overstated. Officers are satisfied with the advice provided by the Council's Property Department and the content of the independent facet surveys commissioned.

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy the need for residential care beds in the Chesterfield area is predicted to decline by approximately 92 beds over 15 years. The need for additional nursing home beds in this area is predicted to increase by around 189 beds in the same time period. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a significant cost, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will chose and need in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The estimated cost of refurbishing The Spinney is £4,690,850. The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work by September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that the Spinney is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.

Goyt Valley House, New Mills

Before making a decision about the future of Goyt Valley House, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about Goyt Valley House at Appendix 2.

Overall, 25 comments were captured from 19 respondents who chose to comment via email, letter, virtual meetings or telephone. There were a further 131 respondents who

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

selected Goyt Valley House as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

Of the 25 comments captured the following were the top three themes:

- Questioning the Council's rationale
- Distress to residents and relatives
- Other comments not falling into a theme

Whilst it is significant that one person responded that their relative residing at Goyt Valley House does not require a larger room or ensuite facilities, the Council must consider the needs and expectations of the people of Derbyshire in the future and ensure that public money is invested to ensure that those expectations can be met.

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy, the need for residential care beds in the High Peak area is predicted to decline by approximately 56 beds over 15 years (from 2020 – 2035). The need for additional nursing home beds in this area is predicted to increase by around 204 beds in the same period. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a cost of £4,274,550, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will choose and need in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that Goyt Valley House is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.

Gernon Manor, Bakewell

Before making a decision about the future of Gernon Manor, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about Gernon Manor at Appendix 2.

Overall, 15 comments were captured from 9 respondents who chose to comment via email, letter, virtual meetings or telephone. There were a further 109 respondents who selected the Gernon Manor as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

Of the 15 comments captured the following were the top three themes:

- Distress caused to residents and relatives
- Questioning the Council's Strategy
- Other comments not falling into a theme

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy, the need for residential care beds in the Derbyshire Dales area is predicted to decline by

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

approximately 67 beds over 15 years (from 2020 – 2035). The need for nursing home beds in this area is predicted to increase by around 196 beds in the same time period. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a cost of £3,887,000, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will chose and need in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work by September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that Gernon Manor is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.

Ladycross House, Sandiacre

Before making a decision about the future of Ladycross, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about Ladycross at Appendix 2.

Overall, 32 comments were captured from 20 respondents who chose to comment via email, letter, virtual meetings or telephone. There were a further 216 respondents who selected Ladycross House as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

Of the 32 comments captured the following were the top three themes:

- Distress caused to residents and relatives
- Opposed to closure generally
- The property should be refurbished whilst the residents remain in situ

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy, the need for residential care beds in Erewash is predicted to decline by approximately 114 beds over 15 years (from 2020 – 2035). The need for nursing home beds in this area is predicted to increase by around 280 beds in the same time period. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a cost of £4,809,300, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will chose and need in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work by September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that Ladycross is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Beechcroft, Ilkeston

Before making a decision about the future of Beechcroft, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about Beechcroft at Appendix 2.

Overall, 19 comments were captured from 17 respondents who chose to comment via email, letter, virtual meetings or telephone. There were a further 112 respondents who selected the Beechcroft as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

Of the 19 comments captured the following were the top three themes:

- Distress caused to residents and relatives
- Refurbish the home
- Other responses not falling into a theme

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support Strategy, the need for residential care beds in Erewash is predicted to decline by approximately 114 beds over 15 years (from 2020 – 2035). The need for nursing home beds in this area is predicted to increase by around 280 beds in the same time period. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a cost of £4,418,300, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will chose and need in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work by September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that Beechcroft is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.

East Clune, Clowne

Before making a decision about the future of East Clune, Members must consider the analysis above and contained within this paragraph, alongside detailed comments made about East Clune at Appendix 2.

East Clune is a home that historically supported an integral Day Centre for older people. The service has not been used since March 2020 and the two residents that used the service prior to the pandemic have subsequently moved to alternative accommodation. There was no feedback about the Day Centre in response to the consultation.

There were 13 comments captured from 5 respondents who chose to respond via email, letter or telephone call. There were a further 101 respondents who selected

APPENIX 3 – ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

East Clune as one of the options of the homes they were providing feedback about when completing the questionnaire.

The three top themes for East Clune were:

- Distress caused to residents and relatives
- A new property should be built on the site
- Negative impact on the local community

As set out in the Housing, Accommodation and Support, the need for residential care beds in the Bolsover area is predicted to decline by approximately 54 beds from 2018 – 2035 with a slight increase of 7 beds predicted by 2025. The need for additional nursing home beds in this area is predicted to be around 139 beds over the next 15 years. Even if the home were to be refurbished at a cost of £4,704,650, we know that the demand for these beds is likely to decrease and therefore investment in the type of care and accommodation people will chose in the future is set out as the preferred option for this home.

The requirement for arrangements to be made to complete the rewiring work by September 2022 means that residents will not be able to remain in these properties beyond this date whilst this work is undertaken.

The recommendation is that East Clune is closed on a permanent basis after the current residents have been supported to find local suitable alternative accommodation.